MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE VILLAGE OF THOMASTON

July 24, 2023

The Landmarks Preservation Commission met on Monday, July 24, 2023 at Village Hall, 100 E. Shore Road, Thomaston, NY at 7:30 p.m.

Present: Donald Stern, Chair, Leila Mattson, Deputy Chair, Miriam Chatinover, Julie Georgopoulos, Gary Noren, and Village Administrator Denise M. Knowland

Absent: None

Chairman Stern opened the meeting at 7:30 p.m.

Mr. Stern welcomed everyone to the meeting. He particularly thanked Julie Georgopoulos, a new member of the Commission, who is a registered architect and has professional experience with historic landmarks, for her assistance in preparation of the written draft determination previously posted to the Village website.

Mr. Stern noted that public comment on the question of whether 46 S. Middle Neck Road should be designated as a Landmark pursuant to the Village Code had previously been received by the Commission on June 13, 2023 (and the Commission had welcomed written comments after that date, which were posted on the Village website as received), so that the purpose of the current meeting is for the Commission to determine whether or not to designate the building as a landmark, and to approve a report of the Commission's determination for forwarding to the Village Board of Trustees. Accordingly, there will be no public comment at the current meeting.

Mr. Stern informed the public that, since the Commission's last meeting, he had prepared a draft report (titled "Draft Written Determination") which was intended to reflect Mr. Stern's perception of the consensus of the other Commissioners as to whether or not to designate the building as a landmark. Commissioner Julie Georgopoulos made significant contributions to the draft, and Mr. Stern prepared a revised draft reflecting her comments, as well as comments received from the Village Attorney. The revised draft was then circulated to the other members of the Commission for their comments. The Draft Written Determination posted on the Village website on July 17, 2023 (one week prior to the current meeting) reflected everyone's comments.

Approval of June 13, 2023 Minutes

RESOLUTION 23-02

Upon motion of Gary Noren, seconded by Miriam Chatinover, and unanimously approved, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, that the minutes of Landmarks Preservation Commission held on June 13, 2023 are hereby accepted as presented.

The vote on this resolution was: Donald Stern, Chair:AyeLeila Mattson, Deputy Chair:AyeGary Noren:AyeJulie Georgopoulos:AyeMiriam Chatinover:Aye

SEQRA Determination

RESOLUTION 23-03

Upon motion of Donald Stern, seconded by Miriam Chatinover, and unanimously approved, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, that the Village of Thomaston Landmarks Preservation Commission, acting as Lead Agency in accordance to with the State Environmental Quality Review Act for review of the proposed landmark designation of premises 46 S. Middle Neck Road, Thomaston, New York, hereby determines that the proposed action is a Type II Action pursuant to 6 NYCRR section 617.5(c)(38).

The vote on this resolution was: I	Donald Stern, Chair:	Aye	Leila Mattson, Deputy Chair:	Aye
(Gary Noren:	Aye	Julie Georgopoulos:	Aye
Ν	Miriam Chatinover:	Aye		

Designation of 46 S. Middle Neck Road (the "Building") as a Landmark

Mr. Stern then summarized certain portions of the Draft Written Determination, and stated his views as to factors relevant to the designation of the Building as a Landmark, as more fully described in the Draft. He noted the following in particular:

- (i) The draft concludes that the building has "particular aesthetic significance to the Village" and is a "structure which embodies the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural specimen, inherently valuable for a representation of a period, style or method of construction," each phrase within the meaning of the definition of "Landmark" in the Village Code. Mr. Stern pointed out that reasonable people can differ as to whether for this purpose a building is of particular aesthetic significance, or is inherently valuable, so that in his view the determination is not easy and necessarily subjective. The Draft Written Determination concludes that the Building meets the definition of "Landmark" in the Code.
- (ii) Designation of a building as a "Landmark" has important implications (potentially positive and negative) for both the owner of a property and the Village, and should not be undertaken lightly or without research and analysis.
- (iii) The Building is a unique structure in the Village. There is nothing else at all similar.
- (iv) The Building is remarkably in its original architectural condition, with no meaningful alterations for the past nearly 100 years, except the reading room addition in 1958 (now more than 60 years old) which conformed to the architectural style of the original 1926 building.
- (v) The location of the Building is also unique, in that it is located on the busiest road in the Village and it is close and very apparent to motorists and pedestrians on busy South Middle Neck Road.
- (vi) While hardship to the owner from landmarking would be an important factor to be considered by the Commission in making a determination whether or not to designate any building as a Landmark, the owner of the Building did not offer any objection or other information that would indicate any hardship to the owner in this case.

Mr. Stern next invited comments from the other Commissioners, after which the following Resolutions were adopted:

RESOLUTION 23-04

Upon motion of Miriam Chatinover, seconded by Gary Noren, and unanimously approved, the following resolution was adopted:

RESOLVED, that the Written Determination attached to these minutes and made a part hereof, (which Written Determination is the same as the draft previously circulated to the Commissioners and posted on the Village website), which designates the existing building located at 46 S. Middle Neck Road, Thomaston, New York, as a Landmark pursuant to Chapter 120 of the Village Code, is hereby approved by the Commission, and it is further

RESOLVED, that the Village Administrator shall transmit a copy of such Written Determination to the Village Board of Trustees.

The vote on this resolution was: Donald Stern, Chair:	Aye	Leila Mattson, Deputy Chair:	Aye
Gary Noren:	Aye	Julie Georgopoulos:	Aye
Miriam Chatinover:	Aye		

Adjournment

Mr. Stern thanked the members of the Commission for their service.

At 7:51 p.m., there being no further business, a motion to adjourn was made by Gary Noren, seconded by Donald Stern and unanimously approved.

The vote on this resolution was: Donald Stern, Chair:	Aye	Leila Mattson, Deputy Chair:	Aye
Gary Noren:	Aye	Julie Georgopoulos:	Aye
Miriam Chatinover:	Aye		

Respectfully Submitted,

Denise M. Knowland Village Administrator